

# PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,

Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ [www.infocommpunjab.com](http://www.infocommpunjab.com),

Email: [psic21@punjabmail.gov.in](mailto:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in)



## FINAL ORDER

**Sarabjit Singh Gill,**  
H.No.60-35-P-376-1,  
St.No.8, Maha Singh Nagar,  
PO Dhandari Kalan,  
Ludhiana.

### **Versus**

**Public Information officer,**  
o/o ATP, Zone-C,  
Municipal Corporation,  
Ludhiana.

**First Appellate Authority,**  
o/o ATP, Zone-C,  
Municipal Corporation,  
Ludhiana.

### **Appeal Case No. 1611 of 2021 (Video Conference Proceedings)**

#### **PRESENT:**

(Appellan) Absent

Satish Kumar, PIO-cum-ATP (Respondent) 9646031802.

Kashish Garg, APIO-cum-Building Inspector from Zone C (Respondent)

#### **ORDER:**

1. The RTI applications are dated **7.1.2021** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding Challan No.21250 Dated 4.6.2020**, as enumerated in his RTI applications. First Appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **8.2.2021** and Second Appeal was filed in the Commission on **30.3.21** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice was issued to the parties for first hearing in the Commission on **1.9.2021**.

2. The appellant is absent without intimation. The respondent PIO represented by Satish Malhotra, ATP accompanied by Ms Kashish Garg, Building Inspector from Zone-C, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana are present via Video Conference Facility from Ludhiana. In a reply vide Letter No.473/Drg.-c/D/PIO Dated 19.2.2021, the respondent PIO has denied the information requested in this RTI application on the ground that it pertains to third party who has in writing requested the PIO to withhold the information from any RTI application.

3. After examining the RTI application and PIO's reply, this Commission is of the view that the PIO has acted prudently and as per law is denying the information which pertains to third party. Further, there is no larger public interest in the information for disclosure of this.

Contd.....2

# PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,

Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ [www.infocommpunjab.com](http://www.infocommpunjab.com),

Email: [psic21@punjabmail.gov.in](mailto:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in)



## Appeal Case No. 1611 of 2021 (Video Conference Proceedings)

4. There is no further cause for action and this appeal case is herewith **CLOSED.**

Sd/-

(ASIT JOLLY)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

1.9.2021

# PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,  
Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ [www.infocommpunjab.com](http://www.infocommpunjab.com),  
Email: [psic21@punjabmail.gov.in](mailto:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in)



## FINAL ORDER

**Yogesh Maini,**  
S/o Late Kapil Bhushan Maini,  
H.No.678/1, Prem Nagar,  
Shiv Mandir Road, Civil Lines,  
Ludhiana.

### **Versus**

**Public Information officer,**  
o/o Municipal Corporation,  
Zone-D,  
Ludhiana.

**First Appellate Authority,**  
o/o Commissioner,  
Municipal Corporation, Zone-D,  
Ludhiana.

### **Appeal Case No. 1375 of 2021 (Video Conference Proceedings)**

#### **PRESENT:**

Yogesh Maini (Appellant)  
Harjeet Singh, Draftsman from Zone-D (for the Respondent) 9812166090

#### **ORDER:**

1. The RTI applications are dated **22.12.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding demolition of the Green Belt in front of House No.678/1,** as enumerated in his RTI applications. First Appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **23.1.2021** and Second Appeal was filed in the Commission on **16.3.21** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice was issued to the parties for first hearing in the Commission on **1.9.2021**.

2. Both the parties are present through Video Conference Facility from Ludhiana. The respondent PIO represented by Harjit Singh, Draftsman, stated that the reply was sent to the appellant vide Letter No.395/ATP/D/RTI-D Dated 25.1.2021 alongwith copy of the notice to demolish the Green Belt cited with respect to Point No.5 of the RTI application which respondents to point No.5 of the RTI application. On examination of said document, the Commission finds that point No. 1 to 4 PIO submission did not refer to any specific document/file etc. which could be defined information as per information under section 2 of RTI Act.

3. Under the circumstances, the Commission is of the view that this RTI application has been addressed to the extent of its possible to do.

4. There is no further cause for action and this appeal case is herewith **CLOSED.**

**Sd/-**  
**(ASIT JOLLY)**  
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.  
Chandigarh  
1.9.2021



# PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,

Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ [www.infocommpunjab.com](http://www.infocommpunjab.com),

Email: [psic21@punjabmail.gov.in](mailto:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in)



## FINAL ORDER

**Jagpal Singh,**

R/o Mangat Colony, Kohara Road,  
Machhiwara Sahib, Tehsil Samrala,  
District Ludhiana.

**Versus**

**Public Information Officer,**

o/o Executive Officer,  
Municipal Council, Machhiwara Sahib,  
Tehsil Samrala,  
District Ludhiana.

### Complaint Case No. 358 of 2021 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Jagpal Singh (Appellant)

Raj Kumar, Junior Assistant (for the Respondent)

ORDER:

1. The Complainant **Jagpal Singh**, filed this RTI application is Dated **29.9.2020** and sought information regarding Schedule Cast Certificate of Jagdish Singh, from the **PIO o/o Executive Officer, Municipal Council, Machhiwara**. When no information was received, the Complainant filed a complaint under section 18 of the RTI Act.2005, to the Commission on 22.3.2021. Notice was issued to the parties for first hearing in the Commission on **1.9.2021**.

2. Both parties are present via Video Conference Facility from Ludhiana. The respondent PIO is represented by Raj Kumar, Junior Assistant, Municipal Council, Machhiwara. This RTI application was transferred to the office of Sub Divisional Magistrate, Samrala who has sent a reply to the appellant stating that the requested record has been submitted and consigned to the record as per the Government instructions.

3. However, on examining the RTI application, the Commission finds that the appellant has sought copy of the Schedule Cast, Certificate submitted by one Jagdish Singh who contested election of Municipal Council, Machhiwara in 2012. Schedule Cast Certificate qualify for exemption as personal information as has been observed by Supreme Court judgment while the respondent PIO has not deemed it fit to deny this RTI application.

4. There is no further cause for action and this Complaint case is herewith **CLOSED**.

**Sd/-**

**(ASIT JOLLY)**

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

1.9.2021